

ASEAN ACADEMIC SUMMIT

1ST ASEAN Academi Summit 2022 (AAS 2022)

“Lighten ASEAN through Collaborative Innovation”

November 7-8, 2022

Venue: Faculty of Social Science and Humanity, University Kebangsaan Malaysia (FSSH-UKM)

Proceedings

ASEAN Academic Summit, Vol. 1 (2022): 45-54

Policy Implementation of Civil Servant Human Resource Management Reform to Strengthen Good Governance at the National Land Agency Office

Mufti Muin Ismail¹, Hamsu Abdul Gani², Aslinda³

^{1,2,3} Public Administration Postgraduate Program Universitas Negeri Makassar - Indonesia

*Corresponding author, contact: (email: muftimuin@unm.ac.id)

Abstract

The reform of Human Resource Management (HRM) for civil servants is a crucial component in realizing good governance, emphasizing transparency, accountability, efficiency, and public participation. At the National Land Agency (BPN) of Makassar City, effective HRM is essential for improving organizational performance and service delivery, particularly given the complex nature of land management issues. This study aims to analyze the implementation of HRM reforms at BPN Makassar, focusing on four key aspects: communication, resources, disposition, and bureaucratic structure. Using a qualitative descriptive method, data were collected through in-depth interviews, observations, and document analysis involving BPN officials and stakeholders. The findings indicate that internal communication within BPN Makassar is effective, fostering transparency in recruitment and HR development processes. Resources, including staff competencies and work facilities, are generally adequate, though disparities in staff distribution persist across service units. The disposition of policy implementers shows positive attitudes, with staff placements reflecting both competence and adaptability, supporting smooth policy execution. Additionally, the bureaucratic structure, characterized by clear Standard Operating Procedures (SOPs) and technical guidelines, ensures efficient program implementation, exemplified by the Complete Systematic Land Registration (PTSL) program. However, limitations of this study include its focus solely on BPN Makassar, limiting generalizability, and the subjective nature of qualitative data. Future research should expand to other regions and incorporate quantitative methods to enhance validity. Additionally, exploring external factors like national policies and socio-political dynamics could provide a more comprehensive understanding of HRM reform impacts in the public sector.

Keywords: Civil Servant; HRM; Good Governance; Implementation Policy

1. Introduction

The reform of Human Resource Management (HRM) for civil servants is one of the main pillars in the effort to realize good governance in various government institutions, including the National Land Agency (BPN). Good governance emphasizes the principles of transparency, accountability, effectiveness, efficiency, participation, and the rule of law, all of which depend on the quality of the apparatus as the implementers of public policy (Fan et al., 2023; Hodge, 2019; Solomon et al., 2022; Wawointana et al., 2016; Wong et al., 2022). In this context, effective HRM is key to improving organizational performance and public service delivery.

In Indonesia, the bureaucratic reforms that have been ongoing since the early 2000s have placed

improvements in HRM as a primary focus, with the hope of creating a professional, integrity-driven, and responsive bureaucracy that meets the needs of society (Berman et al., 2017; Brown, 2004; Hajiali et al., 2022; Martins, 2020). However, the implementation of these reforms often faces various challenges, especially at the regional level, such as in Makassar City. The BPN office in Makassar, as an institution that plays a crucial role in land management, faces significant pressure to enhance transparency and accountability in its services, considering the high complexity and sensitivity of land issues in this region (Jamasy et al., 2023).

The theoretical framework for this study is grounded in the New Public Management (NPM) theory, which advocates for the adoption of private sector management practices in the public sector to increase efficiency and effectiveness (Kesuma et al., 2021). NPM emphasizes decentralization, performance measurement, and results-oriented management, which are essential in evaluating the success of HRM reforms. Additionally, the Human Capital Theory by Wirtz et al. (2022) highlights the importance of investing in human resources as a means to improve organizational performance and service delivery.

Although many studies have discussed bureaucratic reform and HRM at the national level, there remains a gap in the literature regarding specific implementations in regional institutions, particularly in the land sector. Studies such as those by (Berman et al., 2017; Bhandari & Shvindina, 2022; Darby, 2023; Martins, 2020) have explored HRM reforms in other governmental sectors, highlighting both successes and persistent challenges. However, studies on how HRM reforms affect the performance of civil servants at the BPN office in Makassar City are still limited, necessitating further research to fill this void. Addressing this gap is crucial because effective implementation at the local level significantly determines the overall success of the reforms (Hassett, 2022).

This study aims to analyze the implementation of HRM reforms for civil servants in realizing good governance at the BPN office in Makassar City. By examining how the principles of good governance are applied through HRM reforms, this study is expected to provide a clearer picture of the factors that support and hinder this process. The contribution of this research is both theoretical and practical. Theoretically, it enriches the literature on HRM and good governance at the local level by integrating perspectives from NPM and Human Capital Theory. Practically, the findings of this study can serve as a reference for policymakers and practitioners at BPN and other government institutions in designing and implementing more effective HRM reforms. Moreover, this research also benefits the broader community, particularly in improving the quality of public services in the land sector.

Using a qualitative approach, this study will examine various aspects of the implementation of HRM reforms at the BPN office in Makassar City, including policies, practices, challenges, and outcomes achieved. It is hoped that this study will make a tangible contribution to supporting efforts to realize a better bureaucracy and higher quality public services in Indonesia.

2. Method

2.1 Research Design

This study employs a qualitative research design with a descriptive approach. The qualitative method emphasizes in-depth understanding of phenomena by focusing on behaviors, perceptions, motivations, and actions of individuals within their natural contexts. This approach is chosen to explore the implementation of Human Resource Management (HRM) reform in the National Land Agency (BPN) of Makassar City, analyzing various dimensions of policy execution to achieve good governance.

2.2 Population and Samples

The population in this study includes employees of BPN Makassar, particularly those involved in implementing HRM reforms. The sampling technique used is purposive sampling, selecting key informants who possess comprehensive knowledge about the reform process. These informants include the head of BPN, sub-division heads, land certificate applicants, and notaries. The sampling continues using the snowball technique, where initial informants recommend subsequent participants who are knowledgeable about the

subject

2.3 Instruments

In qualitative research, the primary instrument is the researcher, who actively engages in data collection and interpretation. Additional instruments include interview guides, observation sheets, and document analysis. Data collection tools such as tape recorders, mobile cameras, and other electronic devices may also be utilized to support the process. These instruments help capture comprehensive insights into the HRM reform implementation at BPN Makassar.

2.4 Procedures

The data collection process involves multiple stages. First, interviews are conducted with selected informants to gather detailed insights into the HRM reform implementation. These interviews are repeated to ensure data accuracy and consistency across informants. Next, direct observations of organizational practices, resource availability, and employee interactions are carried out using predefined observation sheets to capture real-time behaviors and processes. Lastly, document analysis is performed by reviewing secondary data such as official reports, procedural manuals, performance evaluations, and other relevant documents to triangulate findings from interviews and observations. To ensure data validity, triangulation is employed by comparing data from different sources and methods, and cross-checking findings with peer reviews and reference materials. This comprehensive approach ensures the reliability and robustness of the research outcomes.

3. Result and Discussion

3.1 Result

Human Resources (HR) of the Apparatus is the most crucial element for the government institution of the National Land Agency (BPN) in Makassar City, serving as the main driver in realizing the vision, mission, and objectives of the government organization. Considering the significant role of Apparatus HR at BPN Makassar, systematic, well-planned, and structured HR management is essential to ensure that both current and future organizational goals are optimally achieved. Therefore, in the context of Bureaucratic Reform, the aspect of Apparatus HR becomes a key focus, necessitating systematic structuring. This program aims to enhance the professionalism of apparatus HR in each government institution, supported by competency-based personnel, transparency, and fair salaries and welfare guarantees. The program is implemented through the refinement of the HR cycle, starting from planning, recruitment, and placement of employees according to their competencies. The primary focus of this study is the implementation of the apparatus HR management system at the National Land Agency of Makassar City, analyzed from four aspects: 1) communication, 2) resources, 3) disposition, and 4) bureaucratic structure.

3.1.1 Communication

Communication in the implementation of the human resource management (HRM) system at the National Land Agency (BPN) of Makassar City plays a crucial role in ensuring the success of policy execution. This communication process involves the transmission of messages from policymakers to implementers, as well as from implementers to staff and the public. For communication to be effective, it requires timeliness, clarity of information, and consistency in message delivery. Effective communication involves three basic components: the sender, the message content, and the receiver. In the context of BPN, communication is carried out through one-way instructions from the ministry to BPN employees, and two-way socialization between BPN employees and the public handling land certification.

Based on interviews with BPN employees, internal communication within the office has been running well. Employees expressed satisfaction with the socialization efforts related to the development of the HRM system.

One employee, DA, stated that the recruitment mechanism is adjusted according to the agency's needs and the required competencies, and communication among employees flows smoothly. Furthermore, the recruitment process considers relevant fields of study, as mentioned by Mrs. N. This indicates that effective communication plays a role in ensuring alignment between organizational needs and employee competencies.

However, despite the effectiveness of internal communication, there are still challenges in disseminating information to the public. Some employees noted that information about programs and procedures at BPN has been clearly communicated and is accessible to the public. For example, ID mentioned that information related to HR planning and development has been transparent and easy to access. Nevertheless, there are still members of the public who struggle to understand this information, especially regarding the use of online systems. This highlights the need to enhance public outreach to ensure that people fully understand the procedures for land certification.

In the recruitment process, both vertical and horizontal communication between leadership and employees at BPN has also been implemented. AA, the Head of the Rights Determination and Registration Section, stated that HR needs are analyzed together with department heads before being submitted to the central government. However, AS, a staff member in the structuring section, revealed that communication with the ministry sometimes does not run optimally, resulting in the number of accepted positions not aligning with expectations. MS, the head of BPN Makassar, emphasized that the recruitment process must adhere to the principles of neutrality, objectivity, and accountability, and ensure that competent contract employees are accommodated in the proposed positions.

The research findings indicate that communication in the implementation of the HRM system at BPN Makassar City has been fairly effective, both in the internal context among employees and in interactions with the public. Clarity, consistency, and transparency in information delivery are key factors in ensuring the effectiveness of policy implementation. However, there is still room for improvement, particularly in enhancing public understanding of applicable procedures and strengthening coordination with relevant ministries in the recruitment process.

3.1.2 Resources

Resources are a crucial element in policy implementation, including within the human resource management (HRM) system at the National Land Agency (BPN) of Makassar City. Without adequate resources, policy execution will face significant obstacles. The resources in question encompass staff, authority, and facilities that support institutional operations. Based on the research findings, BPN Makassar has demonstrated commendable efforts in ensuring the availability and optimal use of these resources. The Head of BPN Makassar, MS, emphasized the importance of having staff that meet both quantitative and qualitative qualifications to ensure each service division operates optimally according to its duties and responsibilities.

Staff, as human resources at BPN Makassar, play a central role in supporting policy implementation. The competence and commitment of employees are key to achieving organizational goals. Interviews with employees, including DA and MM, revealed that BPN Makassar staff work according to their main duties and functions and understand the organization's vision and mission. Competency development is carried out through continuous training and education tailored to the needs of each division. This approach ensures that employees not only understand their tasks but are also capable of executing them efficiently and effectively.

However, challenges persist, particularly regarding the distribution of tasks and the uneven number of employees across service units. Data tables show that out of 156 total employees, only 69 are directly involved in service delivery, highlighting the need to increase the workforce, especially in priority programs like the Complete Systematic Land Registration (PTSL). Employees such as RA and MJ have noted that a shortage of technical staff hinders the achievement of work targets. As a result, BPN Makassar relies on contract workers to fill these gaps while awaiting their formal appointment as civil servants (PNS) or government employees with a work agreement (PPPK).

In terms of authority, BPN Makassar ensures that each employee understands the limits of their authority to prevent misuse. Clear authority aligned with regulations helps prevent violations or deviations in task

execution. Interviews indicated no signs of authority misuse at BPN Makassar, suggesting that good governance practices have been effectively implemented. Strict supervision and a transparent work culture play vital roles in maintaining the institution's integrity.

Adequate work facilities are also an essential supporting factor in policy implementation at BPN Makassar. Facilities such as comfortable workspaces, sufficient technological equipment, and other supporting infrastructure have been continuously improved and updated. Interviews with employees revealed that the current facilities adequately support work processes, although there is still room for improvement, particularly in acquiring more advanced technological tools to accelerate workflows. The budget for infrastructure has been gradually allocated to meet these needs.

The research findings indicate that the resource aspect at BPN Makassar has been well-managed and effectively supports policy implementation. Efforts to enhance employee competencies, utilize contract staff, and provide adequate work facilities demonstrate BPN Makassar's commitment to delivering high-quality public services. While challenges remain, the strategic measures already in place indicate that the HRM system at BPN Makassar operates in line with good governance principles, ultimately boosting public trust in land services in the city.

3.1.3 Disposition

Disposition, or the attitude of policy implementers, plays a critical role in the success of policy implementation at the National Land Agency (BPN) of Makassar City. Disposition reflects the personality, perspectives, and willingness of employees to perform their duties effectively. Employees with positive attitudes, such as responsibility, enthusiasm, and adherence to superiors' instructions, tend to contribute significantly to the success of policies. Conversely, negative attitudes like lack of motivation or non-compliance can pose serious obstacles. Therefore, staff placement at BPN Makassar is conducted by considering attitudes and perspectives that align with the organization's vision.

Proper staff placement at BPN Makassar is carried out by assessing both the competence and attitude of employees towards their assigned tasks. Interviews with YL and PA indicated that staff with the appropriate potential and skills are assigned responsibilities aligned with their fields, accompanied by training to enhance their competencies. This placement strategy ensures that employees not only understand their tasks but also demonstrate a high level of care in serving the public, particularly in handling land certification. The Head of BPN ensures that appointed staff possess adaptive attitudes and strong teamwork skills, supporting the smooth implementation of policies.

Policy implementation at BPN Makassar is also influenced by clear standard operating procedures (SOPs). These standards help employees understand policy goals and the best ways to achieve them. One of the key programs, the Complete Systematic Land Registration (PTSL), is executed based on SOPs referring to the Regulation of the Minister of Agrarian Affairs and Spatial Planning/Head of BPN No. 6 of 2018, along with the latest technical guidelines. Interviews with AR and AL indicated that the implementation of this program follows strict procedures from planning to reporting, ensuring all stages are conducted systematically and in accordance with regulations.

Granting authority to BPN Makassar employees is also a significant component of disposition. Each employee is assigned clear tasks and responsibilities according to their competencies, as outlined in the SOPs. This process ensures that task execution runs effectively and efficiently. AR, the Coordinator of Land and Spatial Registration Substances, explained that the PTSL program implementation follows the standards established in the technical guidelines from the Ministry of Agrarian Affairs and Spatial Planning/National Land Agency (ATR/BPN). With clear authority, employees can perform their duties with greater confidence and direction.

The success of disposition in policy implementation at BPN Makassar is also evident from public responses. An interview with DW, a beneficiary of the PTSL program, indicated that the program's implementation adhered to the established procedures. The public reported feeling well-served, from the initial outreach phase to the issuance of land certificates. This reflects that BPN employees not only perform their tasks effectively but also exhibit positive attitudes when interacting with the public, an essential indicator of effective

disposition.

The research findings suggest that disposition in the implementation of the HRM system at BPN Makassar has been effective. Proper staff placement, clear delegation of authority, and positive employee attitudes towards their tasks are key factors in the successful execution of policies. By adhering to strict SOPs and ensuring employees possess attitudes that support the organization's vision, BPN Makassar has succeeded in delivering effective and efficient public services, particularly through the PTSL program. This demonstrates that good disposition impacts not only internal organizational performance but also enhances public trust in the services provided.

3.1.4 Bureaucratic Structure

The bureaucratic structure in the implementation of human resource management (HRM) at the National Land Agency (BPN) of Makassar City plays a crucial role in ensuring the smooth execution of policies. This structure consists of Standard Operating Procedures (SOP) and the division of responsibilities (fragmentation). SOPs serve as work guidelines that ensure every bureaucratic activity runs consistently, effectively, and efficiently, while adhering to existing regulations. In the context of BPN, SOPs are replaced by Technical Guidelines that detail the duties and authorities of employees in executing programs such as land certification and land rights registration. These Technical Guidelines act as a framework regulating what is permissible and prohibited in the performance of employee duties.

The implementation of the Complete Systematic Land Registration (PTSL) program in Makassar City is a tangible example of the effective application of bureaucratic structure. The Makassar City Land Office, as the implementing agency, has carried out its duties in accordance with the established characteristics and core responsibilities. According to an interview with AR, Coordinator of the Land and Spatial Registration Substances Group, the PTSL program is implemented by the Makassar City Land Office, which holds full authority over land rights registration and the maintenance of land registration data to ensure legal certainty. This indicates that the bureaucratic structure at BPN Makassar has been tailored to meet institutional needs and support the implementation of national policies.

Employee readiness in implementing the PTSL program is also an important indicator of bureaucratic structure success. In an interview with AL, Head of the PTSL Adjudication Team, it was revealed that BPN Makassar employees are prepared and competent in executing the program. Task assignments are based on each employee's expertise, such as those specializing in surveying and mapping handling physical data collection, while those skilled in land rights determination manage legal data collection. This demonstrates that the bureaucratic structure at BPN Makassar accommodates employee specialization, allowing for more effective and efficient program implementation.

Public service delivery within the PTSL program also adheres to the established SOPs. Interviews with AD and YU indicated that PTSL implementers provide equitable services to the public without discrimination. BPN Makassar staff perform their duties professionally and courteously, without charging fees to the public, as the program is free of charge. Strict supervision of task execution in the field ensures compliance with SOPs, and violations result in sanctions. This shows that the bureaucratic structure at BPN Makassar not only governs internal task execution but also ensures integrity and transparency in public service delivery.

The consistent implementation of SOPs at BPN Makassar indicates that the bureaucratic structure within this institution operates effectively. Every program, including PTSL, is executed based on clear and structured technical guidelines, ensuring that all processes comply with established standards. Direct supervision of field operations also forms part of an effective bureaucratic structure, ensuring that every policy is implemented correctly. Thus, the bureaucratic structure at BPN Makassar supports the achievement of organizational goals and enhances public trust in land services.

The research findings indicate that the HRM system implementation at BPN Makassar, particularly in terms of bureaucratic structure, has been successful. All processes, from planning to program execution, are clearly regulated through technical guidelines that function as SOPs. The execution of programs by various stakeholders at BPN Makassar demonstrates good coordination in managing and developing human resources. Based on the research summary, the bureaucratic structure aspect received a "good" rating,

alongside communication, resources, and disposition. This indicates that HRM reform at BPN Makassar has been effectively implemented, supporting organizational goals in delivering fast, accurate, and transparent services to the public.

3.2 Discussion

Human Resources (HR) of the Apparatus plays a crucial role in the successful implementation of policies at the National Land Agency (BPN) of Makassar City. The research findings show that HR management at BPN Makassar operates quite effectively, characterized by good communication practices, adequate resource availability, positive policy implementer attitudes (disposition), and a well-organized bureaucratic structure. Internal communication among BPN employees is considered smooth, particularly in conveying information related to recruitment and HR development. This aligns with Mintzberg (1996) findings, which emphasize that effective communication within organizations relies heavily on the clarity of information and consistency in message delivery. However, challenges remain in disseminating information to the public, especially concerning the use of online systems, highlighting the need for improved external outreach.

In terms of resources, BPN Makassar has performed well in ensuring the availability of staff, authority, and adequate work facilities. Interviews revealed that employees work according to their core duties and functions, with competency development conducted through continuous training. These findings are consistent with Jackson & Dunn-Jensen (2021), who stress that continuous HR competency development is key to enhancing organizational effectiveness. Nevertheless, challenges in the uneven distribution of staff across service units indicate the need for additional strategies in resource management, particularly in priority programs like the Complete Systematic Land Registration (PTSL).

The disposition or attitude of policy implementers at BPN Makassar also reflects a positive trend. Employees who exhibit adaptive, responsible, and cooperative attitudes are key to the smooth execution of policies. This aligns with Lipsky (2010) theory of "street-level bureaucracy," which suggests that the attitudes and perspectives of policy implementers in the field significantly influence policy implementation effectiveness. Staff placement at BPN Makassar is conducted by considering the alignment of employee attitudes and competencies with their assigned tasks, demonstrating coherence between organizational vision and policy implementation.

The bureaucratic structure at BPN Makassar also plays a significant role in supporting policy implementation. Clear SOPs and technical guidelines ensure that all bureaucratic activities run consistently, effectively, and in accordance with applicable regulations. The execution of the PTSL program, for instance, follows strict SOPs from planning to reporting. This finding aligns with Edwards III (1980), who stated that a good bureaucratic structure should simplify procedures without compromising regulatory compliance. Strict supervision of task execution in the field ensures integrity and transparency in public service delivery.

Overall, the findings of this study indicate that the HRM system implementation at BPN Makassar has been effective, with communication, resources, disposition, and bureaucratic structure serving as its main pillars. The study also demonstrates that good governance principles have been effectively applied, enhancing public trust in land services. These findings are consistent with previous research by (Akib & Ihsan, 2017; Anggraeni, 2016; Dwivedi et al., 2013; Jauhari et al., 2020; Kurniawati et al., 2019; Nugroho et al., 2021; Satispi & Chandra, 2020; Teng-Calleja et al., 2017; Wihantoro et al., 2015), which highlighted that the success of bureaucratic reform heavily depends on effective HR management, transparency in work processes, and policy implementer attitudes that support the organization's vision.

In the context of other studies, these findings are relevant to research conducted by (Ahmad et al., 2020; Alonazi, 2017; Bickler et al., 2020; Norman, 2014; Yi et al., 2014) on public policy implementation in the public service sector, which emphasized the importance of communication, resources, and bureaucratic structure in improving service efficiency. This study reinforces the argument that effective HR management not only enhances organizational performance but also strengthens public trust in government institutions. Thus, the findings of this research contribute significantly to the literature on apparatus HR management, particularly in the context of bureaucratic reform in Indonesia.

3.3 Limitation and Future Research

This study has several limitations that should be considered when interpreting the results and for future research development. First, this research focuses solely on the implementation of human resource management (HRM) systems at the National Land Agency (BPN) in Makassar City, which means the findings may not be fully generalizable to other government institutions with different characteristics. Additionally, the data collected through in-depth interviews and observations are subjective, relying on the perceptions of informants, which could affect the objectivity of the research outcomes. Another limitation lies in the scope of the aspects analyzed, namely communication, resources, disposition, and bureaucratic structure, without considering external factors such as central government policies or socio-political dynamics that might influence HR performance.

For future research, it is recommended to broaden the scope of the study by involving more government institutions across different regions to gain a more comprehensive understanding of HRM implementation in various contexts. Furthermore, quantitative or mixed-method approaches could be employed to enhance the validity of the findings and provide more measurable data. Future studies could also explore the influence of external factors such as national policies, technological changes, or organizational culture on the effectiveness of HR management. Lastly, longitudinal studies could be conducted to monitor changes and developments in HR management over a longer period, thereby offering deeper insights into the dynamics of policy implementation in the public sector.

4. Conclusion

The implementation of the human resource management (HRM) system at the National Land Agency (BPN) of Makassar City has been carried out quite well. This is evident from the analysis of four main aspects: communication, resources, disposition, and bureaucratic structure. Internal communication among BPN employees has been effective, with clear and transparent dissemination of information regarding recruitment and HR development. However, challenges remain in conveying information to the public, particularly concerning the understanding of procedures through online systems. In terms of resources, BPN Makassar has made good efforts to ensure the availability of competent staff and adequate work facilities, although the distribution of employees in several service units still requires improvement. The disposition or attitude of policy implementers at BPN is also positive, with staff placement considering both competence and adaptive work attitudes, supporting the smooth implementation of policies.

Additionally, the bureaucratic structure at BPN Makassar is well-organized through the implementation of clear Standard Operating Procedures (SOPs) and technical guidelines, ensuring that each program runs effectively and efficiently. The Complete Systematic Land Registration (PTSL) program serves as a concrete example of policy implementation in line with SOPs, where all implementation stages are conducted consistently and in a structured manner. This success demonstrates that the principles of good governance have been well applied, enhancing public trust in land services. Nevertheless, this study also highlights the need for improvements in certain areas, such as optimizing coordination with relevant ministries in the recruitment process and enhancing public outreach efforts. Thus, BPN Makassar can continue to refine its HRM system to achieve more effective and efficient performance in the future.

References

- Ahmad, A., Islam, R., & Alam, T. (2020). Media and NGOs: Strategic Effective Governance. In *Building Sustainable Communities: Civil Society Response in South Asia* (pp. 99–113). Springer Singapore. https://doi.org/10.1007/978-981-15-2393-9_5
- Akib, H., & Ihsan, A. (2017). Bureaucratic Reform in Public Service: A Case Study on the One Stop-Integrated Service. *Mediterranean Journal of Social Sciences*, 8(2), 253–258.
- Alonazi, W. B. (2017). Exploring shared risks through public-private partnerships in public health programs: A mixed method. *BMC Public Health*, 17(1). <https://doi.org/10.1186/s12889-017-4489-z>

- Anggraeni, D. (2016). Bureaucratic Reform in the Empirical Perspective and Pathology. *International Journal of Kybernology*, 3(2), 1–14.
- Berman, E. M., Jae Moon, M., & Choi, H. (2017). Public Administration in East Asia: Mainland China, Japan, South Korea, and Taiwan. In *Public Administration in East Asia: Mainland China, Japan, South Korea, Taiwan*. Taylor and Francis. <https://doi.org/10.4324/9781315089317>
- Bhandari, M. P., & Shvindina, H. (2022). Inequality - The unbeatable challenge. In *Inequality - The Unbeatable Challenge*. River Publishers. <https://www.scopus.com/inward/record.uri?eid=2-s2.0-85172758009&partnerID=40&md5=84ebbb72477db97a56324d9bd8879d7a>
- Bickler, G., Morton, S., & Menne, B. (2020). Health and sustainable development: an analysis of 20 European voluntary national reviews. *Public Health*, 180, 180–184. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.puhe.2019.10.020>
- Brown, K. (2004). Human resource management in the public sector. *Public Management Review*, 6(3), 303–309. <https://doi.org/10.1080/1471903042000256501>
- Darby, R. (2023). Public-sector talent management in Southeast Asian emerging economies: a systematic literature review. *International Journal of Human Resources Development and Management*, 23(1), 20–44. <https://doi.org/10.1504/IJHRDM.2023.129325>
- Dwivedi, Y. K., Shareef, M. A., Pandey, S. K., & Kumar, V. (2013). Public administration reformation: Market demand from public organizations. In *Public Administration Reformation: Market Demand from Public Organizations*. Taylor and Francis. <https://doi.org/10.4324/9780203694428>
- Edwards III, G. C. (1980). *Implementing public policy*.
- Fan, Z., Christensen, T., & Ma, L. (2023). Policy attention and the adoption of public sector innovation. *Public Management Review*, 25(10), 1815–1834. <https://doi.org/10.1080/14719037.2022.2050283>
- Hajiali, I., Fara Kessi, A. M., Budiandriani, B., Prihatin, E., Sufri, M. M., & Sudirman, A. (2022). Determination of Work Motivation, Leadership Style, Employee Competence on Job Satisfaction and Employee Performance. *Golden Ratio of Human Resource Management*, 2(1), 57–69. <https://doi.org/10.52970/grhrm.v2i1.160>
- Hassett, M. P. (2022). The Effect of Access to Training and Development Opportunities, on Rates of Work Engagement, Within the U.S. Federal Workforce. *Public Personnel Management*, 51(3), 380–404. <https://doi.org/10.1177/00910260221098189>
- Hodge, I. (2019). Renewing the Governance of Rural Land after Brexit: an Ecosystems Policy Approach. *EuroChoices*, 18(2), 4–10. <https://doi.org/10.1111/1746-692X.12233>
- Jackson, N. C., & Dunn-Jensen, L. M. (2021). Leadership succession planning for today's digital transformation economy: Key factors to build for competency and innovation. *Business Horizons*, 64(2), 273–284. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.bushor.2020.11.008>
- Jamasy, O., Daud, R., Movianto, G. E., Novianty, E., Su, D., & Listyaningsih. (2023). The Impact of Human Resources Management, Collaboration, Partnership with Empowerment Approach Mediating on Sustainability of FMSRB Program Asset Management. *International Journal of Social Science Research and Review*, 6(10), 466–480.
- Jauhari, A., Majid, M. S. A., Basri, H., & Djalil, M. A. (2020). Are E-government and bureaucratic reform promoting good governance towards a better performance of public organization? *Quality - Access to Success*, 21(175), 25–30. <https://www.scopus.com/inward/record.uri?eid=2-s2.0-85085217656&partnerID=40&md5=3f554300d711eb93bd1b292183dcff29>
- Kesuma, A. I., Utami, A. K., Akib, H., Hasim, D., & Yunus, M. R. (2021). Reactualization of Tourism Destination Management Policy: Good Practices from Indonesia. *Turkish Online Journal of Qualitative Inquiry (TOJQI)*, 12(7), 2679–2689.
- Kurniawati, N., Lubis, A. R., Darsono, N., & Chan, S. (2019). Do good governance and service quality mediate the effect of bureaucratic reform on performance of the archival institutions in Indonesia? *Quality - Access to Success*, 20(169), 72–80. <https://www.scopus.com/inward/record.uri?eid=2-s2.0-85061979724&partnerID=40&md5=20e4f4d25ea080197c13753119e0774f>
- Lipsky, M. (2010). *Street-level bureaucracy: Dilemmas of the individual in public service*. Russell Sage Foundation.
- Martins, L. M. (2020). *Implementation of Government Policy on Giving Cross-Border Cards to*. 05(May).

- Mintzberg, H. (1996). Managing government, governing management. *Harvard Business Review*, 74(3), 75.
- Norman, D. J. (2014). From shouting to counting: Civil society and good governance reform in Cambodia. *Pacific Review*, 27(2), 241–264. <https://doi.org/10.1080/09512748.2014.882393>
- Nugroho, S., Bandonu, A., & Suharyo, O. (2021). Human resources development assessment planning program and bureaucratic reform management on the performance of government organization. *Management Science Letters*, 11(4), 1429–1438. <https://doi.org/10.5267/j.msl.2020.10.020>
- Satispi, E., & Chandra, I. (2020). Implementation of Bureaucratic Reform in Government of South Tangerang City. *ICSS 2019: Proceedings of the 2nd International Conference on Social Sciences, ICSS 2019, 5-6 November 2019, Jakarta, Indonesia*, 139.
- Solomon, G., Feleke, A., Yasin, T., Alemu, M. D., Getachew, N., Worku, N., & Chanie, M. G. (2022). Practice of Health Care Governance among South Wollo Department Heads and Managers of Public Health Institutions, Northeast Ethiopia. *SAGE Open Medicine*, 10. <https://doi.org/10.1177/20503121221136012>
- Teng-Calleja, M., Hechanova, M. R. M., Alampay, R. B. A., Canoy, N. A., Franco, E. P., & Alampay, E. A. (2017). Transformation in Philippine local government. *Local Government Studies*, 43(1), 64–88. <https://doi.org/10.1080/03003930.2016.1235561>
- Wawointana, T., Akib, H., Tahmir, S., & Kerebunu, F. (2016). Role of local institutions “mapalus” as a basis of public service in the field of security and public order in minahasa, Indonesia. *Social Sciences (Pakistan)*, 11(13), 3370–3374. <https://doi.org/10.3923/sscience.2016.3370.3374>
- Wihantoro, Y., Lowe, A., Cooper, S., & Manochin, M. (2015). Bureaucratic reform in post-Asian Crisis Indonesia: The Directorate General of Tax. *Critical Perspectives on Accounting*, 31, 44–63. <https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1016/j.cpa.2015.04.002>
- Wirtz, B. W., Weyerer, J. C., Becker, M., & Müller, W. M. (2022). Open government data: A systematic literature review of empirical research. *Electronic Markets*, 1–24. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s12525-022-00582-8>
- Wong, B. L. H., Maaß, L., Vodden, A., van Kessel, R., Sorbello, S., Buttigieg, S., Odone, A., & Section, E. P. H. A. D. H. (2022). The dawn of digital public health in Europe: Implications for public health policy and practice. *The Lancet Regional Health - Europe*, 14, 100316. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.lanepe.2022.100316>
- Yi, Q., Zhu, X., & Liu, X. (2014). An exploration of the conditions required of social organizations to be contracted by government as service providers: A study based on analysis of local government documents. *China Nonprofit Review*, 6(2), 197–212. <https://doi.org/10.1163/18765149-12341277>